

Appendix D – Comparative District Plan Analysis Table

Appendix D – Comparative District Plan Analysis Table

Council	Operative/ Proposed/ Draft	Applicable sections	Notable trees approach -policy	Notable trees approach - rules	Street trees/reserve trees-policy/rules	Other tree protection? Natural hazards/coastal/vege etc	Comments	Scheduling Approach
FNDC	Operative	Chapter 12 - Section 5 Heritage	Generally covered off in heritage item policies, policy 12.5.4.3 specifically relates to notable trees - 'That notable trees be provided protection, except where it can be demonstrated that they pose a hazard to people or habitable buildings.'	Trimming and felling is provided the tree has died, or is required to prevent immediate risk to people/property* - PA. Activity complying with notable tree rules but not Part 2 of the Plan - Environment Provisions or Part 3 of the Plan - District Wide Provisions – RDA. Activity not complying with notable tree PA standards – DA.	There are no tree rules in the recreation or transport chapters relating to reserves or street trees. FNDC have a 'Tree and vegetation guideline' document produced 2008 regarding trees in reserves, street trees, private trees and road corridor management. This guideline includes applications for the removal of street trees. This guideline is used by operations team/ infrastructure arm but is not used by resource consents.	Notable trees are included in Chapter 12 'Natural and physical resources' Chapter 12 section 2 - Indigenous Flora and Fauna – includes provisions relating to removal of indigenous vegetation. Chapter 12 section 4 - natural hazards (section 4) – doesn't contain rules re. trees. Chapter 12 refers to compliance with Part 2 Environmental Provisions and Part 3 District Wide provisions however, there are no rules in these chapters relating to vegetation clearance/tree protection. No rules in coastal chapter.	Facilities Planner Carine Andries advised tree management guideline is due to be reviewed. Policy team advised that there is going to be an update to the plan to include Urban design matters which will place more emphasis on street trees and open space.	Evaluated using the New Zealand Institute of Horticulture Tree Evaluation Method: • size of the tree; • the importance of its position; • the presence of other trees; • the rarity of the species; • the setting and the tree's importance to that setting; • life expectancy and health of the tree; • form or shapeliness of the tree; • any other special features associated with the tree that may increase its value as a notable tree.

*Conditions/Permitted activity standards apply which must be complied with to retain their permitted activity status.

Appendix D – Comparative District Plan Analysis Table

Council	Operative/ Proposed/ Draft	Applicable sections	Notable trees approach -policy	Notable trees approach - rules	Street trees/reserve trees- policy/rules	Other tree protection? Natural hazards/coastal/vege etc	Comments	Scheduling Approach
Kaipara	Operative 2013	Chapter 19 Notable trees.	<p>19.6.1 By identifying and where landowners agree, protecting Notable Trees in the District Plan.</p> <p>19.6.2 By recognising that Notable Trees can cause unreasonable hazard to people or buildings or can create unreasonable restriction on landowners' opportunities to provide for their social and economic well-being.</p> <p>19.6.3 By encouraging landowners to protect Notable Trees on their land through the provision of information and by offering development incentives.</p>	<p>Removal permitted if tree is dead or for emergency work, otherwise DA.</p> <p>Activities (earthworks, development etc) is permitted so long as not within dripline of notable tree, otherwise is DA.</p> <p>Trimming/maintenance permitted provide meets PA standards, otherwise a RDA.</p>	<p>Reserve Management Units in chapter 20 but no reference to trees.</p> <p>No reference to street trees.</p>	Vegetation clearance rules are included in zone chapters.	The District Plan does not provide general tree protection rules and the protection of Notable Trees is provided with the agreement of the landowners concerned. In addition, it is noted that the District Plan does contain vegetation clearance rules within each Zone Chapter, which offer protection to groups of trees / vegetation though this is largely for protection of ecological and landscape values. Objectives and policies re. vegetation clearance are included in chapter 6 (ecological) and 7 (natural hazards), however rules are in zone chapter. Chapter 18 refers to ONLs, again rules are in zone chapter. Zone rules relate to clearance of indigenous vegetation.	STEM
Auckland	Operative 2016	Chapter D13 – Notable Tree overlay	<p>Provide education and advice to encourage the protection of notable trees and notable groups of trees in rural and urban areas;</p> <p>Require notable trees and notable groups of trees to be retained and protected from inappropriate subdivision, use and development</p>	<p>Biosecurity tree works – permitted.</p> <p>Dead wood removal–permitted if undertaken by arborist, if not undertaken by arborist - CA.</p> <p>Emergency tree works – Permitted.</p> <p>Tree trimming, if complying with PA standards, permitted, otherwise RDA.</p> <p>Tree removal – DA.</p> <p>Works within protected root zone complying with PA standards – permitted, otherwise RDA.</p>	<p>Street trees Chapter E17</p> <p>Policies:</p> <p>(1) Trees in roads that contribute to cultural, amenity, landscape and ecological values are protected. (2) There is an increase in the quality and extent of tree cover in roads, particularly within areas identified for intensified living. (3) The safe and efficient development, maintenance, operation and upgrading of the transport system and utilities is enabled while ensuring that the overall</p>	Additional vegetation clearance rules in overlays (ONL, SEA, HNC) chapter E15.		AUC has developed criteria based on the previous legacy councils. These criteria used STEM and the Royal NZ Institute of Horticulture Tree Evaluation Method (RNZIH) derived from the Helliwell system in Europe. Consideration was also given to the Trees A-H system used in the UK. There are three types of criteria: Special factors (standalone), Negative factors and Tree Specific factors. The special factor criteria are stand alone which means that if a tree or group of trees meets any one criterion then it is deemed notable. The tree-specific criteria require a

*Conditions/Permitted activity standards apply which must be complied with to retain their permitted activity status.

Appendix D – Comparative District Plan Analysis Table

Council	Operative/ Proposed/ Draft	Applicable sections	Notable trees approach -policy	Notable trees approach - rules	Street trees/reserve trees- policy/rules	Other tree protection? Natural hazards/coastal/vege etc	Comments	Scheduling Approach
					<p>ecological and amenity values provided by trees in roads are maintained.</p> <p>Rules:</p> <p>Biosecurity tree works – Permitted. Dead wood removal – Permitted. Emergency tree works - permitted. Pest plant removal – permitted. Tree trimming, if complying with PA standards, permitted, otherwise RDA. Tree removal of any tree less than 4m in height and less than 400mm in girth – Permitted. Tree removal of any tree greater than 4m in height or greater than 400mm in girth – RDA. Planting over network utilities with trees with a mature height of more than 4m – Permitted. Tree trimming, alteration or removal not otherwise provided for – DA.</p> <p><u>Open Space Chapter E16</u></p> <p>Policies:</p> <p>(1) Encourage ongoing maintenance of trees to enhance open space zones, while recognising existing constraints and functional requirements of the site. (2) Manage trees within open space zones to protect their cultural, amenity, landscape and ecological values, while</p>			<p>cumulative assessment. That means, for a tree or group of trees to be notable, it must have a cumulative score of 20 or more out of 40 using the scoring systems described in Appendix 1. Both the special factor and tree-specific criteria are used in combination to determine whether a tree or group of trees is notable. A tree will be notable if it meets only one of the special factors or the score threshold for tree-specific criteria. In addition, the assessment against the Special factor and tree-specific criteria is then balanced by taking into account the potential negative effects of the tree. In situations where negative effects occur then these must be offset against the benefits of protecting a notable tree. Special Factors – Heritage; scientific, ecosystem, cultural, intrinsic, negative.</p> <p>Tree Specific – age and health, character and form, size and visual contribution.</p> <p>Negative effects</p>

*Conditions/Permitted activity standards apply which must be complied with to retain their permitted activity status.

Appendix D – Comparative District Plan Analysis Table

Council	Operative/ Proposed/ Draft	Applicable sections	Notable trees approach -policy	Notable trees approach - rules	Street trees/reserve trees- policy/rules	Other tree protection? Natural hazards/coastal/vege etc	Comments	Scheduling Approach
					<p>acknowledging that multiple uses occur in open space areas. (3) Encourage the use of indigenous trees and vegetation for planting within open space zones, where appropriate, to recognise and reflect cultural, amenity, landscape and ecological values.</p> <p>Rules:</p> <p>Biosecurity tree works – Permitted. Dead wood removal – Permitted. Emergency tree works - permitted. Pest plant removal of any tree less than 4m in height and less than 400mm in girth – permitted. Tree trimming, if complying with PA standards, permitted, otherwise RDA. Works within the protected root zone complying with A standards – Permitted, otherwise RDA. Tree removal of any tree less than 4m in height and less than 400mm in girth – Permitted. Tree removal of any tree greater than 4m in height or greater than 400mm in girth – RDA.</p>			
TCDC	Appeals version – no appeals therefore can be treated as operative.	Section 11 Significant trees (obs and pols); Section 35 Significant trees rules.	1a – work on or within the vicinity of a significant tree shall be carried out in a way that does not adversely affect the health of the tree. 1b – work on a significant tree shall be carried out in accordance with accepted arboriculture practice. 1c – financial incentives may be considered where they can assist private property owners with the	Rule 1 – Activities within the vicinity of a significant tree: Activities that are permitted in the underlying zone retain their activity status provided that: Parking or storage of materials, vehicles or machinery is on existing sealed, formed surfaces;	Tree strategy 2002. Tree masterplans fulfil the requirements of the 2002 strategy which covers all Council trees, and reinforce the amenities and natural values of the area. The documents are intended to guide tree selection processes for public	No tree/vegetation clearance rules in conservation zone, DOC land has a system of permissions and concessions for land use under the Waikato Conservation Management Strategy. There is a natural hazard chapter and an open	Vegetation clearance is controlled at zone level with additional significant tree provisions overriding them.	1. Notable significance – the tree is of significant age or exemplifies significant stature, vitality or form. 2. Botanical or scientific significance the significance of the tree because of its rarity, its representativeness, its value as a native tree or its unusual genetic form.

*Conditions/Permitted activity standards apply which must be complied with to retain their permitted activity status.

Appendix D – Comparative District Plan Analysis Table

Council	Operative/ Proposed/ Draft	Applicable sections	Notable trees approach -policy	Notable trees approach - rules	Street trees/reserve trees-policy/rules	Other tree protection? Natural hazards/coastal/vege etc	Comments	Scheduling Approach
			<p>care and maintenance of a significant tree.</p> <p>1d – the removal or felling of a significant tree shall be avoided, unless there are health and safety reasons for its removal.</p> <p>2a – subdivision and land use activities shall take into account the location of significant trees on a site being subdivided and/or developed and integrate them with the design and layout to retain their significance.</p> <p>2b – subdivision and land use activities should consider private property rights as well as the public value of significant trees.</p>	<p>Does not involve compaction, sealing, removal or addition of soil;</p> <p>There is no discharge of a substance that may harm the tree;</p> <p>There is no excavation except that within the road zone excavation no deeper than 200mm and at least 2m away from the tree trunk and any sealing is within an existing formed carriageway or footpath is permitted.</p> <p>Excitation within the protected root zone not permitted as per the above is a controlled activity.</p> <p>Any other activity not complying with the above provisions is an RDA.</p> <p>Rule 2 – Maintenance or enhancement of a significant tree: Maintenance/enhancement including pruning, trimming, dead wooding, crown reduction, cutting thinning or topping* - PA. Maintenance/enhancement not permitted as above – RDA.</p> <p>Rule 3 – Felling or damaging a significant tree: Tree is dead, damaged, dying or diseased* - PA. Tree is a hazard to people or property* - PA. Utility works* - PA. Other felling or damaging of a significant tree – NCA.</p>	<p>reserves and road berms. The plans identify trees that contribute to each ward's character and ensure that these tree species and others be considered for all future plantings.</p>	<p>space zone chapter, both of which include rules on natural hazards – neither of which have rules on tree/vegetation clearance.</p>		<p>3. Historic heritage significance – the tree is associated with historic events, people and significant periods in the development of the district.</p> <p>4. Cultural and spiritual significance – the tree has significant customary or spiritual value to a particular group of people.</p> <p>5. Landmark significance – there are visual and spatial qualities which make the tree an important landscape feature of a particular area.</p> <p>6. Functional significance – the tree has a significant physical and ecological function which may include amenity or climatic benefits (e.g. shade, screening, shelter and temperature control).</p> <p>7. Amenity values – the qualities and characteristics of a tree that contribute to people's appreciation of it.</p>

*Conditions/Permitted activity standards apply which must be complied with to retain their permitted activity status.

Appendix D – Comparative District Plan Analysis Table

Council	Operative/ Proposed/ Draft	Applicable sections	Notable trees approach -policy	Notable trees approach - rules	Street trees/reserve trees-policy/rules	Other tree protection? Natural hazards/coastal/vege etc	Comments	Scheduling Approach
QLDC	Proposed	Chapter 26 Historic Heritage & Chapter 32 Protected Trees	32.2.1.1 Identify and schedule in the District Plan the District’s protected trees. 32.2.1.2 Protect scheduled trees from avoidable removal, removal of the protected tree status or inappropriate trimming or destruction, recognising them as an important part of the character, amenity and heritage values of the District. 32.2.1.3 Recognise where genuine circumstances exist, the removal or significant trimming of protected trees may not be avoidable because the values of the tree for which it was protected have significantly deteriorated, or the tree is causing a hazard to life or property. 32.2.1.4 Permit works and maintenance to be undertaken on protected trees where the work will assist in maintaining the health of the tree.	Minor trimming – PA. Significant trimming – DA. Works with protected rootzone – DA. Maintenance of protected hedgerows (to be supervised by qualified arborist) – PA. Removal or significant trimming of protected tree where the tree: is dead, diseased, damaged or hazard to life or property* – PA. Maintenance of the ground within the protected root zone e.g. lawn mowing domestic gardening – PA. Any works to a protected tree or within protected root zone – DA.	Chapter 32 Protected trees also includes provisions for protection of character trees and street trees in Arrowtown Management Areas. <u>Streets and public spaces</u> Policies: 32.2.2.1 Provide efficiencies to the Council where it is responsible for the conservation, maintenance and management of trees within streets and public spaces. 32.2.2.2 Recognise that trees within streets and public spaces provide a significant contribution to the amenity, heritage and biodiversity values of the Arrowtown Residential Historic Management Zone. 32.2.2.3 Protect trees within streets and public places in the Arrowtown Residential Historic Management Zone while acknowledging the primary function of streets and public spaces. Rules: Works by Council or their agent Removal or significant trimming where there is the tree is dead, diseased, damaged or likely to cause harm to people or property* – PA. Tree trimming– PA. Works within protected root zone - PA.	Chapter 34 Wilding Exotic Trees; Chapter 33 Indigenous vegetation lwi management plans.	Operative DP had a blanket tree protection rule in zones which is no longer relevant since change in legislation. Through proposed plan have schedule ‘character’ tree which are considered to contribute to the character, amenity and historical status of Arrowtown however do not meet STEM criteria. Protected trees (Heritage/scheduled trees) based on STEM assessment. Trees within the road or public spaces in Arrowtown.	STEM.

*Conditions/Permitted activity standards apply which must be complied with to retain their permitted activity status.

Appendix D – Comparative District Plan Analysis Table

Council	Operative/ Proposed/ Draft	Applicable sections	Notable trees approach -policy	Notable trees approach - rules	Street trees/reserve trees- policy/rules	Other tree protection? Natural hazards/coastal/vege etc	Comments	Scheduling Approach
					<p>Removal or significant trimming of any tree <4m in height – PA. Removal or significant trimming of any tree >4m in height – DA.</p> <p>Works by any other person/party Significant trimming or removal – DA. Any works within the protected root zone – DA.</p> <p><u>Character trees</u></p> <p>32.2.3.1 Identify and schedule in the District Plan trees and groups of trees within the Arrowtown Residential Historic Management Zone that contribute to the zone’s unique character and heritage values. 32.2.3.2 Protect or enhance Arrowtown’s unique character and amenity by recognising the contribution trees and groups of trees make to Arrowtown’s landscape, cultural identity and historic heritage values. 32.2.3.3 Acknowledge the important role trees and groups of trees have in contributing to the character and historic heritage of Arrowtown, despite that on an individual basis a tree or group of trees may not be significant in stature. 32.2.3.4 Have regard to the reasonable and efficient use of land anticipated in the Arrowtown Residential Historic Management zone,</p>			

*Conditions/Permitted activity standards apply which must be complied with to retain their permitted activity status.

Appendix D – Comparative District Plan Analysis Table

Council	Operative/ Proposed/ Draft	Applicable sections	Notable trees approach -policy	Notable trees approach - rules	Street trees/reserve trees- policy/rules	Other tree protection? Natural hazards/coastal/vege etc	Comments	Scheduling Approach
					<p>while ensuring the removal or modification of trees or groups of trees does not lead to the cumulative loss of Arrowtown’s heritage character and amenity values.</p> <p>Rules:</p> <p>Significant trimming, removal, destruction or damage of a tree or hedgerow - RDA. Minor trimming of tree/hedgerow – PA. Works within protected root zone – RDA. Any building, excavation or trenching for underground services within protected root zone of a tree or hedge – RDA. Maintenance of character hedgerow* PA. Removal or significant trimming of a character tree that is dead, diseased, damaged or likely to cause hazard – PA.</p>			

*Conditions/Permitted activity standards apply which must be complied with to retain their permitted activity status.